



HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION



Approved Minutes

February 6, 2018, 8:30 a.m.
Committee Room, 2nd Floor, City Hall
101 City Hall Plaza, Durham, NC

I. Call to Order

Chair Jordan called the meeting to order at 8:35 a.m.

II. Roll Call

Members Present:

Matt Bouchard
Jonathan Dayan
Tad DeBerry
Joe Fitzsimons
Katie Hamilton
Joseph Jordan, Chair
Tom Kreger

Excused Members Absent:

Le'Andre Blakeney
Wanda Waiters

Staff Present:

Grace Smith, Planning Supervisor
Karla Rosenberg, Planner
Terri Elliott, Clerk
Don O'Toole, City Attorney's Office

III. Adjustments to the Agenda - None

IV. Approval of Summary Minutes for November 28, 2017

MOTION: Approve the Minutes from November 28, 2017 (Jordan, Fitzsimons 2nd)

ACTION: Motion carried, 7-0

December 5, 2017

MOTION: Approve the Minutes from December 5, 2017 (Jordan, Hamilton 2nd)

ACTION: Motion carried, 7-0

V. Swearing-In of Witnesses

Chair Jordan read the opening HPC statement, and asked if there were any early dismissals required by Commission members or Commission members who might have a conflict of interest with the cases presented today. No conflicts of interest were noted, and no early dismissals were requested.

The Clerk to the Board administered the oath to all Citizens and staff who wished to speak at today's meeting.

VI. Certificates of Appropriateness

After the oath was given, Ms. Rosenberg asked that all staff reports and materials submitted at the meeting be made part of the permanent record with any additions, deletions, and or corrections. All Commission members concurred.

- a. **Case COA1700077 – 104 West Parrish Street – Public Art:** The applicant is seeking retroactive approval for a temporary art exhibit attached to the masonry of a landmark structure. Details regarding the proposal can be found in the application materials.

Staff Report: Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

Speakers: Mr. Smith spoke in support. No one spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Mr. Smith gave a brief overview the retroactive approval of the temporary art exhibit attached to the masonry of a landmark structure and the plan to repair the structure.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommended that the application would not be approved but a COA for a repair should be approved.

MOTION: Ms. Hamilton made a motion that the Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA1700077, 104 West Parrish Street – Public Art:

- The applicant has attached a temporary public art piece to a landmark property.
- A banner has been installed along the east elevation of the Clements Building, secured with bolts through only the mortar joints.
- Upon removal of the banner, all resulting holes will be filled with a historically appropriate lime-based mortar, matching the original mortar in color and composition.

Therefore, the conclusion of law is that the proposed public art is consistent with the historic character and qualities of the Historic District and is consistent with the Historic Properties Local Review Criteria, specifically those listed in the staff report, and the Durham Historic Preservation Commission approves the Certificate of Appropriateness for case COA1700077, 104 West Parrish Street with the following conditions:

1. The improvements shall be substantially consistent with the plans and testimony presented to the Commission at the October 3, 2017 Commission hearing and attached to this COA;
2. The improvements may require additional approvals from other City or County departments or state or local agencies; the applicant is responsible for obtaining all required approvals relating to building construction, site work, and work in the right-of-way; and
3. A compliance inspection shall be performed immediately upon completion of the work approved herein.
4. All work listed above will be removed by November 30, 2017.
(Hamilton, Kreger 2nd)

ACTION: Motion fails, 7–0

MOTION: This Historic Preservation Commission having considered and denied COA1700077, 104 West Parrish Street – public art site work continued from October 3, 2017 now finds that the applicant shall be directed to repair all resulting holes will be

filled with a historically appropriate lime-based mortar, matching the original mortar in color and composition in accordance with a methodology approved by the Planning department.

(Jordan, Dayan 2nd)

ACTION: Approved, 7–0

- b. Case COA1700099 – 1314 Carroll Street – Addition and Modifications:** The applicant proposes to remove a nonoriginal enclosed rear porch and deck, and construct a new 685-square foot rear addition with attached deck and stair in its place. In addition, the applicant proposes to remove an original front stoop and awning, and construct a new front porch to resemble other front porches in the district.

Staff Report: Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

Speakers: Mr. Waddell spoke in support. No one spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Mr. Waddell gave a brief overview of the proposed project of 1314 Carroll Street – Addition and Modifications.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommended approval with an amendment related to the stoop and porch.

MOTION: Mr. Fitzsimons made a motion that the Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA1700099, 1314 Carroll Street – Addition and Modifications:

- The applicant proposes an addition and modifications to a contributing structure.
- The applicant has amended the application in the hearing to remove the work related to the front stoop and previously proposed front porch.
- A nonoriginal rear enclosed porch and deck will be removed and replaced with a new 685-square foot addition with attached wood deck and stair; the addition will be constructed using a brick foundation, cementitious fiberboard siding of a 12-inch width, aluminum K-style gutters, triple-grid PVC-clad wood windows, and asphalt roof shingles.
- Non-operable shutters that may or may not be original will be removed.

Therefore, the conclusion of law is that the proposed addition and modifications is consistent with the historic character and qualities of the Historic District and are consistent with the Historic Properties Local Review Criteria, specifically those listed in the staff report, and the Durham Historic Preservation Commission approves the Certificate of Appropriateness for case COA1700099, 1314 Carroll Street with the following conditions:

1. The improvements shall be substantially consistent with the plans and testimony presented to the Commission at the February 6, 2018 Commission hearing and attached to this COA;
2. The improvements may require additional approvals from other City or County departments or state or local agencies; the applicant is responsible for obtaining all required approvals relating to building construction, site work, and work in the right-of-way; and
3. A compliance inspection shall be performed immediately upon completion of the work approved herein.

(Fitzsimons, Hamilton 2nd)

ACTION: Approved, 7–0

- c. **Case COA1700100 – 2114 Fayetteville Street – Addition and Modifications:** The applicant proposes to remove a nonoriginal 120–square foot addition and replace it with a new 252–square foot addition. In addition, the applicant proposes to relocate original windows on the north side of the structure. Replacement of the nonoriginal porch columns has been approved via Minor COA1700102.

Staff Report: Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

Speakers: Mr. McKinney spoke in support. No one spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Mr. McKinney gave a brief overview of the proposed project of 2114 Fayetteville Street – Addition and Modifications.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommended approval with an amendment to the addition roof line.

MOTION: Chair Jordan made a motion that the Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA1700100, 2114 Fayetteville Street – Addition and Modifications:

- The applicant is proposing to remove a previous addition, construct a new addition, and make modifications to a contributing structure.
- The addition will measure 9 feet by 14 feet and the addition roof line will be amended to be distinguishable from the primary roof structure as reviewed in the hearing on February 6, 2018 and will be clad in storefront-style aluminum-framed glass with exposed steel beams and decorative metal screens as reviewed in hearing and approved by Planning Commission Staff.
- Two pairs of original windows on the right side elevation will swap places.
- The nonoriginal front door will be replaced with a new wood door with three full-length glass lights.
- A new rear deck and stair will be constructed of roughly hewn treated lumber with a metal hand rail and horizontal wood railings and skirting.

Therefore, the conclusion of law is that the proposed addition and modifications are consistent with the historic character and qualities of the Historic District and is consistent with the Historic Properties Local Review Criteria, specifically those listed in the staff report, and the Durham Historic Preservation Commission approves the Certificate of Appropriateness for case COA1700100, 2114 Fayetteville Street – Addition and Modifications with the following conditions:

1. The improvements shall be substantially consistent with the plans and testimony presented to the Commission at the February 6, 2018 Commission hearing and attached to this COA;
2. The improvements may require additional approvals from other City or County departments or state or local agencies; the applicant is responsible for obtaining all required approvals relating to building construction, site work, and work in the right-of-way; and

3. A compliance inspection shall be performed immediately upon completion of the work approved herein.
(Jordan, Fitzsimons 2nd)

ACTION: Approved, 7–0

- d. **Case COA1700104 – 1007 Arnette Avenue – Addition:** The applicant proposes to remove a portion of the original structure to construct a new 130–square foot rear addition and a 130–square foot screened porch.

Staff Report: Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

Speakers: Ms. Wirth spoke in support. No one spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Ms. Wirth gave a brief overview of the proposed project of 1007 Arnette Avenue – Addition.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommended approval of this application.

MOTION: Mr. Dayan made a motion that the Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA1700104, 1007 Arnette Avenue – Addition:

- The applicant proposed to remove an original portion of a primary structure and replace it with a new 130-square foot addition and 123-square foot screened porch.
- The addition will have a parge-coated CMU foundation, cementitious fiberboard cladding, and an asphalt-shingled shed roof with left-side hip.
- Three double-hung, Fibrex® windows in a six-over-one configuration will be installed on the rear elevation of the new addition.
- A new screened porch will be constructed of pressure-treated wood with fiberglass screens.

Therefore, the conclusion of law is that the proposed addition is consistent with the historic character and qualities of the Historic District and is consistent with the Historic Properties Local Review Criteria, specifically those listed in the staff report, and the Durham Historic Preservation Commission approves the Certificate of Appropriateness for case COA1700104, 1007 Arnette Avenue – Addition with the following conditions:

1. The improvements shall be substantially consistent with the plans and testimony presented to the Commission at the February 6, 2018 Commission hearing and attached to this COA;
2. The improvements may require additional approvals from other City or County departments or state or local agencies; the applicant is responsible for obtaining all required approvals relating to building construction, site work, and work in the right-of-way; and
3. A compliance inspection shall be performed immediately upon completion of the work approved herein.
(Dayan, Hamilton 2nd)

ACTION: Approved, 7–0

- e. **Case COA1700106 – 2009 West Club Boulevard - Modifications:** The applicant proposes to replace three original windows at the rear of the structure and replace a section

(approximately 256 linear feet) of replacement wood siding with a new poly-ash composite siding in the same area.

Staff Report: Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

Speakers: Ms. Berghausen spoke in support. No one spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Ms. Berghausen gave a brief overview of the proposed project of 2009 West Club Boulevard – Modifications.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommended that the application be approved and specify to keep surrounding trim and only replace the sashes.

MOTION: Mr. Fitzsimons made a motion that The Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA1700106, 2009 West Club Boulevard – Modifications:

- The applicant is proposing modifications to a landmark property.
- Three original windows at the rear of the house, above the screened porch, will be removed and replaced with a new, double-hung, one-over-one, aluminum-clad wood windows.
- Approximately 256 linear feet of nonoriginal wood siding will be removed above the screened porch and replaced with Boral® poly-ash composite siding, to match the original siding in dimensions, profile, and reveal.

Therefore, the conclusion of law is that the proposed modifications is consistent with the historic character and qualities of the Historic District and is consistent with the Historic Properties Local Review Criteria, specifically those listed in the staff report, and the Durham Historic Preservation Commission approves the Certificate of Appropriateness for case COA1700106, 2009 West Club Boulevard with the following conditions:

1. The improvements shall be substantially consistent with the plans and testimony presented to the Commission at the February 6, 2018 meeting including testimony regarding the repair and retainage of the surrounding trim.
2. The improvements may require additional approvals from other City or County departments or state or local agencies; the applicant is responsible for obtaining all required approvals relating to building construction, site work, and work in the right-of-way; and
3. A compliance inspection shall be performed immediately upon completion of the work approved herein.
(Fitzsimons, Bouchard 2nd)

ACTION: Approved, 7–0

VII. Old Business

- a. None

VIII. New Business

- a. Administrative COA updates
- b. Updates on Club Boulevard demolition – Has been built
- c. Updates to the Review of the Local Review Criteria – Ms. Rosenberg gave out potential updates of a working list to the Commission Members to add any ideas they may have.

Ms. Smith will send out an email to everyone to get dates and times for a lunch and learn session 2–2 ½ hours.

d. Phishing Undeliverable Emails – Ms. Elliott to confer with TS department.

IX. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 10:55 a.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Terri Elliott, Clerk
Durham Historic Preservation Commission